



COLLOQUIA

Thursday, November 7 | 3:15-4:30 p.m.

Friendship in a Digital Age: Social Media as a Means to Communion

SALON A | Moderator: Jeff Pojanowski

The panelists propose to share and explore how social media has fostered encounter, friendship, and communion in their lives. Though stories and experiences will differ, a common thread of friendship facilitated by social media will run throughout the discussion.

Rev. Harrison Ayre (Diocese of Victoria)

Shannon Last (Famous Last Words)

Sr. Theresa Aletheia Noble, F.S.P. (Daughters of St. Paul)

Rev. Anthony Sciarappa (Archdiocese of Pittsburgh)

The Ethics of Friendship

SALON B | Moderator: Kevin Scott

“Is Friendship the Ideal in the Second Love Commandment?”

Robert Audi (University of Notre Dame)

We are to love our neighbors as ourselves. Is friendship the intended Christian ideal—or an appropriate ideal? Friendship, like love, requires a measure of altruism. We know the Good Samaritan was beneficent. Was he also altruistic—and what is the difference? This paper explains that difference and argues that full-blooded friendship, like love, is altruistic. But friendship apparently justifies partiality to friends over others. Does altruism? And what degree of priority? Does Aristotelian virtue ethics provide a solution? Has anyone done so? This paper will pursue these questions with examples from everyday life and connections to major ethical theories.

Bio

Robert Audi is a philosophy professor here at Notre Dame. He writes, teaches, and gives public lectures in four areas: ethics and political philosophy, epistemology, philosophy of mind and action, and philosophy of religion. In moral philosophy, his main topics have been in ethical theory, moral epistemology, moral psychology, and value theory, but he also does some work in normative ethics and applied subfields (especially business, medical, and journalistic ethics). In epistemology, perception, memory, the a priori, testimony, and, more generally, the relation of all these to rationality, justification, and knowledge have been among his central interests. In philosophy of mind and action, he's often written on belief, desire, intention, reasons for action, practical reasoning, rational action, freedom and compulsion, self-deception, and weakness of will. His work in philosophy of religion has centered on faith and reason, the problem of evil, religion and morality (including religion and politics), and naturalism as a challenge to a theistic worldview.

“Friendship; and Ecstasy in Aquinas and Pseudo-Dionysius”

Susan Waldstein (Franciscan University of Steubenville)

According to St. Thomas, a friend is “ecstatic”; he is carried outside himself into the other. The friend lives, as it were, in his friend, so that he counts as good for himself what is good for his friend and as bad what is bad for his friend. The lover belongs no longer to himself but to the beloved. Pseudo-Dionysius suggests that God, too, is ecstatic; he lives outside himself in an analogous way in his creatures. When he creates, he places himself in each creature as a sharer in his eros towards himself.

Bio

University of Steubenville after thirty years of homeschooling their eight children. Her area of special interest is the interface of natural science, philosophy of nature, and theology. She writes on topics such as evolution, teleology in nature, the theological meaning of natural forms, bisexual reproduction, and hierarchy in nature. She received her B.A from Thomas Aquinas College in California, her S.T.M. and S.T.L from the International Theological Institute in Austria, and her S.T.D from the University of Fribourg in Switzerland.

“Friendship: Connecting Ethics to Culture”

Br. John Winkowitsch, O.P., (Western Dominican Province)

Friendship must be recovered as an essential component in the study of ethics. Aristotle recognized the vital importance of friendship in the moral life. Not only is friendship the summit of moral virtue for Aristotle, but friendship is also the arena within which virtue develops and leads to happiness. I argue that friendship is the middle term between virtue and happiness. An

academic analysis of virtue will not lead to a virtuous society, nor will a theoretical study of happiness lead to a thriving culture. Only through friendship can we incarnate a virtue theory into a true culture of life.

Bio

Br. John Winkowitsch, OP, was born and raised in Montana before graduating from Thomas Aquinas College in California. Afterward, he began graduate studies in philosophy at The Catholic University of America, writing his Licentiate thesis on the role of friendship in Aristotle's *Nicomachean Ethics*. While a diocesan seminarian for the Diocese of Madison, WI, Br. John defended his dissertation, "W. Norris Clarke's Relational Metaphysics: Being and Person," under the direction of Dr. Gregory Doolan. He is now in his 4th year of formation with the Western Dominican Province, where he has taught at St. Patrick's Seminary & University in Menlo Park, CA, and is now serving at St. Dominic's Church in Los Angeles, CA.

Hearth and Table: Friendship in the Heart of the Home

SALON C | Moderator: Brendan Besh

"Supper Discourse: The Table as the Nexus of Friendship"

Betsy Fentress

Gathering around a table to share a meal has been at the center of friendship in both Eastern and Western civilization. From Homer's guest-friendship in *The Odyssey*, to the Eucharistic banquet in John's gospel and the "Supper Discourses," to *Babette's Feast*, "at table" is where the nourishment of friendship flourishes. My talk will explore the importance and history of hospitality as foundational to the making and advancement of friendships, and present our own attempts at sanctified eating as a mirror of Christ's eucharistic gift.

Bio

Betsy Fentress is the co-author of *Almonds: Recipes, History, Culture* (Gibbs Smith) and *The Bryant Family Vineyard Cookbook* (Andrews McMeel). A professional writer and editor, Betsy earned her bachelor's degree from the University of Missouri School of Journalism and spent time in the graduate English program at Louisiana State University. Betsy has been a mentor for the Hatchery Program at the Skandalaris Center for Entrepreneurial Studies at Washington University, and serves as a council member of the Archdiocese of St. Louis Annual Catholic Appeal. She also spends an afternoon each week at Lolly's Place, an after-school tutoring program in University City, Missouri, where she lives with Sam, her husband, a photographer. Her six children are grown and live hither and yon.

“Theology of Home”

Carrie Gress and Noelle Mering (Theology of Home)

Why do Americans love their homes, spending hundreds of billions of dollars annually on home improvement, renovations, and decor, but meanwhile, the notion of a homemaker is still held in contempt? The theology of home responds to this tension by examining the idea that home is meant to be a foreshadowing of heaven and a preparation for the eternal home that we all, wittingly or not, long for. But perhaps more importantly is translating this reality into what roots and animates the activity of making a home with the qualities of heaven—providing comfort, security, nourishment, and hospitality—that are true gifts to those we love.

Bio

Carrie Gress has a doctorate in philosophy from Catholic University of America. She is the author of several books, including *The Anti-Mary Exposed* (TAN Books, 2019) and *Theology of Home* (TAN Books, 2019). She is also the editor at TheologyofHome.com.

Noelle Mering is the co-author of the book *Theology of Home*, and an editor for the online magazine, TheologyofHome.com. She is a frequent writer on the topics of culture, politics, and religion, and lives in Southern California with her husband and their six children.

“The Millennial Table”

Alex Pitts (Maître de Chai Wine)

A brief history of dining out and eating at home, focused on the resurgence of cooking among Millennials and the shifting dynamics of food as a force for culture.

Bio

Alex Pitts spent a decade cooking in fine dining kitchen, two of them being Cyrus and The French Laundry, before transitioning to the wine business. He worked his way up through the cellar to become the assistant winemaker at The Scholium Project and a co-owner and Winemaker of maître de Chai winery in Napa, California.

Who Is My Neighbor?

HESBURGH ROOM | Moderator: Daniel Philpott

“Friendship Between Nations in the Context of Development Aid: Sovereignty, Solidarity and Subsidiarity”

Maryssa Gabriel (Notre Dame Law School)

The risks of deploying state sponsored development aid to poor nations have been widely debated in the field of international law and foreign policy. However, these debates have not adequately considered whether a philosophical understanding of the core principles which ground development aid could mitigate these risks and provide better guidance for the deployment of development aid. The historical progression towards a model of ‘development cooperation’ shows that the international development community has an awareness of the changing landscape around development aid and that these changes would require a foundational philosophical framework to animate inter-state relations. My presentation provides this framework, putting forth a philosophical justification for the principles of sovereignty, solidarity, and subsidiarity in the context of development aid.

Using these three principles, I argue that a level of friendship between rich and poor nations can exist within the context of deploying development aid. More specifically, I contend that an inter-state relationship based on these principles give rise to certain obligations on the part of both the aiding state as well as the beneficiary state. For example, in discussing the Monterrey Consensus, which resulted from the United Nations International Conference on Financing for Development, I examine how the principles of sovereignty, solidarity and subsidiarity have been used to animate guidelines for the deployment and reception of development aid. The conclusion of my analysis is that such guidelines mitigate the risks of deploying state-sponsored development aid.

Bio

A native of Bermuda, Maryssa Gabriel is a first-year Doctor of the Science of Law (J.S.D.) student at Notre Dame Law School. Ms. Gabriel graduated from Trinity College (Dublin, Ireland) with her bachelor of laws degree in 2010. She then earned a M.Sc. in law from the London School of Economics in 2011. Before earning an LL.M. from Notre Dame Law School in 2018, Maryssa practiced as an attorney in London and in Bermuda. She was admitted as a solicitor of England and Wales in 2015 and is licensed with the New York State Bar and the Bermuda Bar. Her primary research interests are in international human rights, maternal health, bioethics, philosophy of law, and international law.

“How Friendship Relates to Pro-Sociality and Collective Action: Experimental Evidence from an Anti-Poverty Program”

Sandra Polanía-Reyes (University of Notre Dame)

This study examines the role of having friends on prosocial behavior at the onset of a social program for the poor in a developing country. Generosity, reciprocity, trust, cooperation and coordination are the main dimensions of pro-social behavior that determine the ability to solve social dilemmas and achieve the common good. We measure pro-sociality with lab-in-the-field economic games, collect data on friendship, leadership and networks, as well as traditional measures of pro-sociality such as voter turnout, volunteer work and political participation. We find that having friends (not relatives) is positively correlated with pro-sociality.

Bio

Sandra Polanía-Reyes is a visiting assistant professor of economics at the Keough School of Global Affairs at the University of Notre Dame. She holds a PhD in economics from University College London and a PhD in political economy from the University of Siena. Prior to joining the Keough School, Polanía-Reyes was an assistant professor in economics at Pontificia Universidad Javeriana in Bogotá, Colombia, a research associate at Corpovisionarios (a Colombian think tank on social innovation), a visiting fellow at the Kellogg Institute of International Studies, and a postdoctoral fellow at the de Nicola Center for Ethics and Culture. Over the last fourteen years, Polanía-Reyes has engaged with communities in Argentina, Colombia, Costa Rica, Italy, Peru, United Kingdom, United States, Uruguay, and Venezuela. Her academic work has been published in the *Journal of Economic Literature* and the *Journal of Economic Behavior and Organization*, among other journals and books.

“Encountering the Other: A Case Study of the Humanitarian Corridor Project from Ethiopia to Italy”

Ilaria Schnyder von Wartensee (University of Notre Dame)

Since 2017 the Italian Church has partnered with the Italian government to establish “humanitarian corridors,” i.e. legal and safe pathways toward citizenship for 500 refugees. This research project considers intercultural friendship through qualitative analysis of personalized encounters, accompaniment, and the integration of refugees within the host communities. Findings suggest that encounters are a method of integral human development. Our research explores and refines the concept and role of encounter and accompaniment in integration efforts with a special emphasis on expectations, spirituality, responsibility, and personal freedom.

Bio

Ilaria Schnyder von Wartensee's principal research interest is international development and migration with a particular interest in dignity and integral human development. She helps to

implement the Ford Program's human development projects, drawing on her expertise in qualitative methods and ethnography in Africa, Latin America and Europe. A native of Switzerland, she holds a PhD in international law and economics from Bocconi University in Milan and an MSc in anthropology and development from the London School of Economics.

Alter Christus, Alter Amicus

JOYCE ROOM | Moderator: Robert Fastiggi and Michael Platt

“Friendship, Disabilities and Priesthood in a Concentration Camp”

Rev. Samuel Bellafore (Our Lady of Victory, Troy, NY)

The Nazi Aktion T4 program of involuntary euthanasia lasted from 1939 to 1945. Hartheim Euthanasia Centre housed part of the program and held mainly two kinds of prisoners: priests and people with disabilities. Blessed Frantisek Drzewiecki lived in Hartheim for one month before his execution there in 1942. Combining historical research with creative writing, this presentation empathetically imagines the life he led alongside inmates with disabilities. What were their interactions? What is the right relationship between Christians and people with disabilities? The weakness of priesthood and Christianity reveals that people with and without disabilities are not so dissimilar. That realization enables friendship.

Bio

Rev. Samuel Bellafore is a priest of the Diocese of Albany, NY. He graduated from the University of Notre Dame in 2015 with degrees in philosophy and music. He attended St. Joseph's Seminary (Dunwoodie) in New York, where he wrote a thesis entitled “Imagery and Analogy in Joseph Ratzinger.” He was ordained as a priest in June and serves as the associate pastor of Our Lady of Victory in Troy, NY. In his spare time he sabotages the seriousness of his conference bios by telling you that he loves bad puns.

“Priestly Confessor as Friend”

Rev. Michael Black (Catholic University of America)

This paper will examine the intimate friendship that is formed with the priest in the Confessional. In supporting this claim, I will highlight two things that take place in the Confessional that establish their good and virtuous friendship. First, the Platonic notion that true friends help one achieve knowledge of themselves is lived out as the soul is examined before the Divine Tribunal in the presence of the Confessor. Second, the priest, formed in the Sacred Heart of Christ aflame with love for the sinner, suffers with the penitent as an alter Christus in true misericordia.

Bio

Rev. Michael Black was ordained to the Priesthood for the Diocese of Covington on May 16, 2015. He graduated from Notre Dame with a B.A. in Honor's philosophy and theology in 2011. He graduated from the Pontifical College Josephinum in 2015 with a M.Div, S.T.B. in systematic theology, and an M.A. in systematic theology. He is currently finishing the requirements for an ecclesiastical license in philosophy from the Catholic University of America with a focus on the thought of Aristotle and Thomas Aquinas.

“Bound Forever With Chains of Esteem’: The Troubled Friendship of Father Theodore Hesburgh and Pope St. Paul VI”

Brooke Tranten (Marquette University)

Father Theodore Hesburgh, C.S.C. struck up a friendship with Giovanni Battista Cardinal Montini during Notre Dame's 1960 Commencement exercises. Their friendship continued upon Montini's elevation to the papacy in 1963. However, the fallout over the publication of an interview by Leo Joseph Cardinal Suenens, critical of the power of the Roman Curia, fractured their friendship. This paper will examine Hesburgh's relationship with Pope Paul VI and clarify the cause and manner of its breakdown based on an evaluation of Hesburgh's own comments on the role of the Curia in papal governance and other sources about Pope's relationship with the Curia.

Bio

Brooke Tranten is a doctoral student in American history at Marquette University. She holds a Master of Theological Studies in the history of Christianity from Notre Dame and a B.A. in Catholic studies and history from the College of the Holy Cross (Worcester, MA). Her research interests include 20th century American Catholic history and print culture, the Catholic intellectual tradition, and 20th century Polish history.

Friendship in the Public Square **CARMICHAEL ROOM | Moderator: Gladden Pappin**

“Building the Kingdom: Locke's Theology of Hope”

Connor Grubaugh (University of Notre Dame)

The concept of tolerance, often traced to Locke, is central to friendship between members of modern societies. But both defenders and critics of Locke have tended to downplay the importance of Christian theology in his thought. I argue that Locke was neither a proponent of

atomic individualism nor a closeted atheist, but a political theologian intent on radically reimagining the relationship between divinity and human government for the sake of worldly improvement. A crucial figure in the liberal political tradition, Locke was also an early practitioner of liberal theology, and his political teaching cannot be understood apart from this.

Bio

Connor Grubaugh is a graduate student in political theory and international relations at the University of Notre Dame. He received his B.A. in history from the University of California, Berkeley, and worked in journalism before beginning doctoral studies. His research examines the influence of religion and philosophy of history on the history of political thought.

“René Descartes and the Cause of Humanity”

Tyler Thomas (University of Notre Dame)

My paper investigates the theme of humanity in the philosophy of René Descartes. Specifically, I examine the movement of Descartes’s *Discourse on Method* which, in its final part, culminates in a redefinition of public virtue as the willingness and ability to contribute to a common scientific project for the betterment of mankind. In his writings, Descartes is almost silent on friendship as a philosophical theme. I contend that Descartes deliberately replaces "friendship" with the more expansive notion of humanity. This development would later influence the promoters of "the religion of humanity," including its founder Auguste Comte, and remains consequential insofar as "humanitarianism" represents perhaps the sole uncontroversial form of public morality today.

Bio

Tyler Thomas is a doctoral student in political theory and constitutional studies at the University of Notre Dame. His dissertation subject is the philosophy of René Descartes, which is also the subject of his presentation today. He completed his undergraduate studies in philosophy, political science, and English literature at Hiram College, in Hiram, Ohio, and hails from Cleveland.

“Friendship as Political Standard, Ethical Mediation and Spiritual Mystery”

Giulio De Ligio (Catholic University of Paris)

According to Modern political science, society rests on contracts or neutral encounters of subjectivities, interests or rights that require no practical virtues or common understanding of the just or the good. Modern men, however, may be ready to admit that the experience of friendship is both decisive and challenging: its gifts as well as its failures touch and move the whole of human existence. My paper will deal with this “common” bearing of friendship by touching on

three “depths” of it: friendship can still be seen as a political standard, as an ethical mediation and as a spiritual mystery.

Bio

Giulio De Ligio is an associate researcher at the Ecole des hautes études en sciences sociales (School for Advanced Studies in the Social Sciences) of Paris and teaches political philosophy and ethics at the Catholic University of Paris. He has written several essays on 20th century political philosophy, on the analysis of modern political regimes and on the theological-political problem (from Leo Strauss to Charles Péguy). Among his books, mainly written and edited in French and Italian: *The Sadness of the Political Thinker* (2007); *Politics and the Soul. On Pierre Manent* (eds., with J.V. Holeindre and D. Mahoney, 2014); *The Machiavelli Problem* (2014) and his recent *Democracy and the Contents of Life. Reflections of Political Philosophy* (2018).

Among his essays written in English: *The Question of Political Regime and the Problems of Democracy. Aron and the Alternative of Tocqueville* (in *The Companion to Raymond Aron*, Routledge 2016) and *The City and the Whole. Remarks on the Limits and the Seriousness of the Political in Strauss's Thought* (in *Leo Strauss and his Catholic Readers*, Catholic University of America Press, 2018).

He is also a co-founder and member of the editorial board of the Italian journal *Rivista di Politica* (Rome), and of the scientific board of the Dominican Center of the Saulchoir (Paris). He was awarded the Prix Raymond Aron in 2007.