



## COLLOQUIA

Saturday, November 9 | 9-10:15 a.m.

---

### **‘I Have Called You Friends’**

**AUDITORIUM | Moderator: Colum Dever**

#### **“The Servant Does Not Know What His Master is Doing’: Aristotle and Newman on Practical Knowledge, Incarnate and Empty”**

**Jonathan Buttaci (The Catholic University of America)**

Aristotle often disparages theory without embodied experience—the experience even mere servants and manual labors have—and in practical, productive, and speculative contexts alike (e.g. *Nicomachean Ethics* II.4, *Metaphysics* A.1, X.9, *de Caelo* III.7). There are similarly practical analogues to merely notional assent in Newman, securing the need for good works that are, in a sense, the matter and means of holiness (e.g. *Plain Sermons*, *Grammar*). Drawing on these sources I explore this Johannine text, how friendship with the master and true knowledge of his doings does not free oneself from a servant’s deeds, but rather from a servant’s ignorance.

#### **Bio**

Jonathan Buttaci is an assistant professor of philosophy at the Catholic University of America in Washington DC. He arrived there in 2016 after completing his PhD at the University of Pittsburgh under James Lennox and John Henry McDowell. His research focuses on Aristotle's theory of knowledge, of learning, and of the human mind.

#### **“From Lex Orandi to Lex Credendi: The Experiential Epistemology of Coming to Know Christ as Friend”**

**Mark Cherry (St. Edward’s University)**

Christianity cannot be secured by philosophical projects designed to provide a justification of faith. This presentation explores Christianity’s experiential epistemology: right worship and properly oriented asceticism are central to knowing God and His commands. These day-to-day practices sustain a distinctly Christian culture and its moral practices. Christ’s insistence that “You are my friends if you do what I command you” (John 15:14-15) is an invitation to enter into the mystical experience that is central to the life-world of Traditional Christianity, learning to pray properly so as to come to know God and thereby the content of the moral life.

## **Bio**

Mark J. Cherry is the Dr. Patricia A. Hayes Professor in Applied Ethics and Professor of Philosophy at St. Edward's University, Austin, Texas. His research encompasses ethics and bioethics, together with social and political philosophy. He is the author of *Kidney for Sale by Owner: Human Organs, Transplantation and the Market* (2005 / 2015) and *Sex, Family, and the Culture Wars* (2016). He is Editor of *The Journal of Medicine and Philosophy*; Senior Editor of *Christian Bioethics*; Co-editor of the book series: *Annals of Bioethics* and Editor of the book series *Philosophical Studies in Contemporary Culture*.

## **“Friendship and the Trinity in John 15:15, ‘I have called you friends’”**

### **Michael Waldstein (Franciscan University)**

The paper takes three steps. It first looks at the context of Jesus's words about friendship in John 15, in which one finds the golden chain of a paradigm rooted in the Trinity. As the Father has loved me, so I have loved you. As I have loved you, so you are to love one another. The paper then looks at how John Paul understands this golden chain in his theology of the body. Finally, it compares this view of friendship with Aristotle, based on the discussion of ripe fruit in the *Meteorology*.

## **Bio**

Michael Waldstein is Professor of New Testament at Franciscan University. He received his B.A. from Thomas Aquinas College (1977), PhD in Philosophy from the University of Dallas (1981), S.S.L. from the Pontifical Biblical Institute in Rome (1984), and ThD in New Testament and Christian Origins from Harvard University (1990). He's taught at Notre Dame, Ave Maria University, and was Founding President of the International Theological Institut in Gaming, Austria.

---

## **Friendship and Idols**

**ROOM 158 | Moderator: Michael Bradley**

## **“Friendship and Risk”**

### **James Mumford**

The question of what it means to make the good of another one's own could easily receive the answer ‘helping her pursue her own good.’ Only such an answer, it is often thought, would satisfy the requirement that true friendship be other-regarding. This paper explores why such an answer is a mistake. Drawing upon Alasdair MacIntyre, Robert Adams and Talbot Brewer, first I asks what follows for our account of friendship if we question the presupposition that one's good

is synonymous with the satisfaction of one's preferences. I then explore the political and theological dimensions of this re-imagination of friendship.

### **Bio**

James Mumford is a Visiting Fellow at the McDonald Centre at Christ Church, Oxford and also a Fellow at the University of Virginia's Institute for Advanced Studies in Culture. Educated at Oxford and Yale, his first book, *Ethics at the Beginning of Life*, was published by Oxford University Press in 2013. His second book, *Vexed: Ethics Beyond Political Tribes*, is coming out in May 2020 with Bloomsbury. He writes on ethical, political, theological and literary topics for a range of American and British publications including *The Spectator*, *The Guardian*, *The Atlantic* and *The New Statesman*. He is currently working on a project on contemporary psychology and nihilism.

### **“‘Love them to death’: Assisted Suicide and Solidarity Today”**

#### **Marianna Orlandi (Princeton University)**

"Euthanasia and assisted suicide are a defeat for all. We are called never to abandon those who are suffering, never giving up but caring and loving to restore hope." Pope Francis.

In a world where a depressed teenager is granted a “right” to starve herself to death, “friendship” might require a new definition. In the legal scene, criminal law reforms and increasing acceptance of a so-called "right to die" risk not only violating the absolute value of life, but also forgetting the substantial need for solidarity. Among friends, there is no duty to kill, but to rescue—and to love.

### **Bio**

Marianna Orlandi is a 2019-2020 James Madison Program Associate Research Scholar (Department of Politics, Princeton University). She is an Italian attorney and graduated in law from the University of Padua, Italy and then continued her studies in criminal law, receiving her PhD from both the University of Padua and the University of Innsbruck, Austria. She worked for two years for a pro-life NGO in the United States and later moved back to Italy, where she practiced as a criminal lawyer, in Milan. Her profound interest in legal philosophy and on the principles that stand beyond and justify the positive law, which are the basis of her studies, recently brought her back to the United States and to academia. Since September 2019, she is a research fellow at Princeton, where she focuses on the legal and philosophical differences between decriminalization of abortion and euthanasia and the recognition of such practices as expression of fundamental human rights.

## **“Augustine and the Features of Fallen Friendships”**

**Randall Smith (University of St. Thomas, Houston)**

Peter Brown says of Augustine that he “hardly ever spent a moment of his life without some friend, even some blood-relative, close by him. No thinker in the Early Church was so preoccupied with the nature of human relationships.” Friendship can be a great blessing. And yet, being fallen people in a fallen world, even friendship can be corrupted. In this paper, I will recount some of Augustine’s experiences of friendship and the lessons we should learn from him about the dangers certain kinds of friendship can pose to our virtues and well-being.

### **Bio**

Randall B. Smith is the Scanlan Foundation Endowed Professor of Moral Theology at the University of St. Thomas in Houston, Texas. His book *How to Read a Sermon by Thomas Aquinas: A Beginner’s Guide* is available from Emmaus Press. And his next book *Aquinas, Bonaventure and the Scholastic Culture at Paris: Preaching, Prologues, and Biblical Commentary* is due out next year from Cambridge University Press.

---

## **Friendship on the Margins** **ROOM 159 | Moderator: Sr. Ann Astell**

## **“Is Friendship the End of Criminal Justice? Dante’s *Comedy*, Pilgrimage, and the Healing of the Carceral Imagination”**

**Thomas Graff (University of Cambridge)**

Dante’s *Comedy* offers compelling resources for the healing of the carceral imagination in contemporary society in and through its meditation on the nature of friendship. Over against the dysfunctional human relationships modelled in the *Inferno*, the *Purgatorio* is an invitation to radical friendship: a shared narrative space in which to reconcile oneself to the other as equally in need of human recognition, support, and wonder. Accordingly, what would it look like to re-imagine prison as a place of shared purgation rather than of isolated damnation? This invitation, however, is double-edged: for it is only by confronting *our* proclivity to condone, affirm, and perpetuate carceral systems of hopeless punishment that we can establish new forms of human community and kinship at the heart of criminal justice.

### **Bio**

Thomas Graff is a doctoral student in the Faculty of Divinity at the University of Cambridge, studying under Dr. Rowan Williams. He received his B.A. in Philosophy, Theology, and Italian and an M.A. in Italian Studies from the University of Notre Dame and an MPhil in Theology, Religion, and Philosophy of Religion from the University of Cambridge. His current research

concerns the relationship between Christology and poetics in Dante's *Comedy* in light of Augustine. His other research interests include tragic representation, religious language, soteriology, and prison education. He submitted this paper as an excuse to see the grotto and his niece and nephew.

### **“With Aristotle but Beyond It: Hauerwas and Vanier on Christian Friendship”**

**Alessandro Rovati (Belmont Abbey College)**

Aristotle's reflection on the role of friendship in attaining an authentically good life looms large in the Christian tradition. Following the work of theologian Stanley Hauerwas, the paper reflects on the Christian appropriation of Aristotle's insistence on the necessity of friendship for the moral life. Then, it highlights how Jesus' witness challenges some Aristotelian presuppositions and expands the Christian understanding of friendship. Finally, it considers how Jean Vanier's befriending of people with disabilities provides a contemporary embodiment of the Gospel's calling.

#### **Bio**

Dr. Alessandro Rovati is Department Chair and Assistant Professor of Theology and Director of Study Abroad at Belmont Abbey College. A graduate of the Università Cattolica del Sacro Cuore di Milano, Italy, Dr. Rovati's scholarship focuses on Christian ethics, moral and political philosophy, Catholic social teaching, moral theology, and political theology. He has published extensively peer-reviewed journals and online publications, while also traveling in several dioceses to teach youth, laity, clergy, catechists, and teachers about the riches of the Catholic faith and the challenges Christians face in today's society.

### **“Dante's Road to Friendship: The Community in *Purgatorio*”**

**Matias Sur (University of Notre Dame)**

In Dante's *Divine Comedy*, the community of the souls in *Purgatorio* provide for us an example of the ideal Christian community. This fact perfectly contraposes the souls inhabiting *Inferno*, who are consumed by self-love and loathing. Through a careful analysis and presentation of the text, I will show how friendship is made manifest between the protagonists, Dante and Virgil in the two realms. It is this friendship, and the community of souls in *Purgatorio*, that parallel with Christ's message on friendship in John 15:15. Dante's message is perfectly applicable towards a greater understanding of friendship in the modern world today.

#### **Bio**

Matías Sur is a student at the University of Notre Dame currently pursuing his Master's in Italian Studies. His thesis topic focuses on the way that individual liberty and national liberty create a

sense of identity in the Italian nation during the Risorgimento and how this idea of liberty becomes transnational via Italian immigration into the Americas as seen in Ippolito Nievo's *The Confessions of an Italian*. One of the key objectives of this research is to view how Nievo's *magnum opus* establishes the idea that Italian immigration functioned to express a transnational sense of "Italianness" to the Americas.

---

**From Philia to Agape**  
**ROOM 160 | Moderator: Brian Mulholland**

**"The Virtue of Chastity Blossoms in Friendship"**

**Ron Belgau (Spiritual Friendship)**

In this talk, I draw on the Christian tradition to look at how the Catechism's statement that the "virtue of chastity blossoms in friendship" can be developed into a new perspective on chastity that is better able to diagnose what is wrong with the sexual revolution's approach to sexuality, and offer an alternative rooted in a Christian understanding of the person and of human love. Such an understanding can provide a better context for discerning a married or celibate vocation, choosing a spouse, and sustaining Christian growth in an increasingly hostile culture.

**Bio**

Ron Belgau is the co-founder of Spiritual Friendship, an influential group blog dedicated to musings on God, sexuality, and relationships. He taught ethics, medical ethics, and philosophy of religion at St. Louis University for several years, and was invited to speak at the World Meeting of Families as part of Pope Francis's 2015 visit to the United States.

**"Man, My Beloved: A Christian Case for Falling in Love with Your Friends"**

**Christopher Damian (Target Corporation)**

In today's culture, conversations about love and eros have become almost entirely subsumed into the topics of sexuality and marriage. This paper will delve into the Christian tradition to argue that true friendship will be an erotic relationship, in its highest sense. Drawing on thinkers such as Aristotle, St. Bonaventure, John Henry Newman, Christos Yannaras, and Pope John Paul II, it will give a renewed account of eros as that which draws man out of himself and gives birth in creativity, demonstrating the ways in which becoming friends really is a process of falling in love.

## **Bio**

Christopher Damian received his B.A. in philosophy from the University of Notre Dame and his J.D. and M.A. in Catholic Studies from the University of St. Thomas, where he was a fellow for both the Center for Catholic Studies and the Terrence J. Murphy Institute on Catholicism, Law, and Public Policy. He is a co-author of three chapters of "Roadmap," which was published by the American Bar Association in 2015 and received the E. Smythe Gambrell Professionalism Award in the same year. His most recent essay, "A Catholic Perspective on Homoerotic Desire," was published in the Winter 2019 edition of *Logos Journal*. He has spoken professionally on Catholicism, homosexuality, law, the clergy abuse crisis, and immigration. He currently works for Target Corporation, where he negotiates contracts for professional services and writes corporate policy on contingent labor. In his free time, he runs a monthly creative writing workshop for Twin Cities Catholics and organizes young adult responses to the clergy abuse crises. He is currently considering further graduate work in theology, but he also finds himself tempted by programs in religious studies as a way of avoiding the moral burdens of being a professional theologian.

## **“Friendship in Marriage: From Eros through Philia to Agape”**

**Margaret Monahan Hogan (Director of Medical Humanities at Collegium at the University of Pennsylvania)**

This paper considers marriage as a particular kind of friendship—“as the crown of life and the school of virtue”—from its origin in eros through its maturity in philia to its end in agape. As the crown of life marriage moves from and through ordered, related and integrated horizontal, vertical, and transcendental levels of finality to accomplish ends that are, respectively, essential, excellent, and absolute. As a school of virtue it acknowledges the natural and upward dispositive role of eros originally as spontaneous union to human friendship and from friendship finally to charity as friendship with Christ.

## **Bio**

Margaret Monahan Hogan, PhD is the Director of Medical Humanities at Collegium at the University of Pennsylvania. She was the Founding Executive Director of Garaventa Center for Catholic Intellectual Life and American Culture at the University of Portland in Oregon. She is the Nerney-Hanson Professor Emeritus of Ethics. She was Medical Ethicist for Allied Service/John Heinz and Wilkes-Barre General Hospital. She was Founding Director: King’s College Center for Ethics and Public Life and the President, Center for Academic Integrity at Duke University. She was the Chair of Luzerne County Accountability, Conduct, and Ethics Commission. She was the first fellow of the de Nicola Center for Ethics and Culture.

---

## Till We Have Faces

ROOM 161 | Moderator: Anthony Monta

### “Growing Pains: Friendship, Loss, and the Child’s Imagination”

**Lilia Draime (University of Saint Thomas)**

My paper will examine the implications of friendship and loss in the lives of children. Imaginary friends and friendships formed with toys are critical for the development of children, providing a space for the drama of their lives to play out. Antoine de Saint-Exupery's *The Little Prince* and A.A. Milne's *Winnie the Pooh* series will inform my discussion and provide rich examples of children who must leave behind the worlds they have fashioned. We readers can find great wisdom and hope in these worlds and the eternity they promise, especially as we look towards our ultimate end.

#### **Bio**

Lilia Draime earned her BA in history from the University of Notre Dame in 2015. She majored in history with minors in constitutional studies and philosophy, religion, and literature, and also served as editor-in-chief of the *Irish Rover* during her senior year. Lilia earned her MA in Catholic Studies in 2017 from the University of Saint Thomas in Saint Paul, Minnesota, where she focused her work on Dante's *Comedy*.

### “Friendship as Liberation in Charles Dickens”

**Dwight Lindley (Hillsdale College)**

How to find depth amid the two-dimensional philosophies of late-modern life? In *Hard Times* (1854), Charles Dickens paints a dark backdrop of corporate greed and utilitarian ideology in order to set the light of person-to-person friendship in relief. For Dickens, friendship is the providential path that leads out of the narrow spaces we sometimes construct for ourselves, into the depths of the heart and the full drama of personhood. By presenting friendship as creative and liberating, Dickens delicately suggests (to an age not interested in hearing it) that a good friend must be nothing less than an instrument of God.

#### **Bio**

Dwight Lindley is an associate professor of literature at Hillsdale College in Michigan. He is the author of articles on George Eliot, John Henry Newman, Jane Austen, Virginia Woolf, and Gerard Manley Hopkins, among others. His book project right now advances a fresh theory of literature, broadly Aristotelian but revised in light of the best insights of Romanticism and Christian Platonism. He lives in Hillsdale, Michigan, with his wife and eight children.



## **“Narcissism as the Antithesis of Love, of Friendship in Oscar Wilde's *The Picture of Dorian Gray*”**

**Vera Profit (University of Notre Dame)**

“Sometimes we know unequivocally what is right by observing someone do it all wrong.” Why do narcissists experience profound difficulties in establishing and sustaining fulfilling relationships? Which assumptions inform their decisions? What consequences characterize narcissistic behavior? What do narcissists want? Happiness? Love? All of us can identify with narcissism for we all start there. The supposition, that only our needs matter appropriate for a child, no longer holds validity for an adult. Growing out of that notion remains part and parcel of becoming an integrated individual and takes a long time. Where do we begin and why should we?

### **Bio**

Currently Professor Emerita of German and Comp Lit at ND, the University of Rochester granted Vera Profit her PhD in Comparative Literature (French and German). During her tenure at ND, she was twice recognized for her excellence in teaching. She authored four books; the last is entitled: *The Devil Next Door: Toward a Literary and Psychological Definition of Human Evil*.

---

## **Can Science and Theology Be Friends? ROOM 162 | Moderator: Christopher Baglow**

### **“Human Transcendence in an Evolutionary World”**

**Phillip Sloan (University of Notre Dame)**

The relations of natural science and Catholic theology have generally been constructive and mutually supportive in recent decades, exemplified by St. JPII's important 1988 letter to the Pontifical Academy of Sciences on the relations of science and Catholic Theology. This was followed in 1996 by his letter in which he affirmed that evolutionary theory is “more than a hypothesis.” However, recent developments in some Catholic circles allied with Evangelical Protestants on social issues have attempted to develop a more hostile relationship between contemporary evolutionary biology and Christian belief. This paper will examine where tensions between Church teachings and contemporary evolutionary science remain, and how evolutionary perspectives on human origins need not undermine human dignity and the affirmation of a theological perspective on human beings.

### **Bio**

Phillip Sloan is Professor Emeritus in the Program of Liberal Studies and the Graduate Program in History and Philosophy of Science program at the University of Notre Dame.

Originally trained in evolutionary biology, he received his doctorate in philosophy from the University of California, San Diego in 1970 with a specialization in the history and philosophy of science. He is a Fellow of the AAAS, and the Reilly Center for Science, Technology and Values at Notre Dame. He served for several years on the Committee on Science and Human Values of the National Conference of Catholic Bishops. Sloan has also been closely involved in the Notre Dame Initiative on Adult Stem Cell research, and participated recently in two Vatican conferences on this issue. Sloan is the main editor and contributor to *Darwin in the Twenty-First Century* (UND Press, 2015). He is also the author of two recent entries on the history of evolutionary thought in the *Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*. He is currently working on a book on the conception of life in recent biology and its implications for human dignity.

### **“Human Origin and Identity: Becoming Human within an Evolutionary and Divine Drama”**

#### **Rev. Terrance Ehrman (University of Notre Dame)**

Reconciling human identity as *imago Dei* with an evolutionary origin continues to confound many Christians and calls for further theological explication. I offer a more coherent anthropology that situates humankind within an evolutionary and ecological setting. Charles Darwin’s 1871 *The Descent of Man* attempted to explain humanity solely in terms of natural and sexual selection. In *Laudato Si’*, Pope Francis emphasized human uniqueness that, even within an evolutionary framework, transcends physics and biology. Theological anthropology is rooted in the Genesis account where humans are, like the animals, formed from the ground, indicating a consanguinity among organisms, yet humans also have a transcendent dimension reflective of their receiving the breath of God as the source of life. Humans are clearly in continuity with all other creatures within this natural drama but are unique with a *capax Dei* within the divine drama. I draw upon the philosophical anthropology of David Braine to articulate a non-dualistic Thomistic hylomorphism that preserves the unity of the human person as an organism and that makes sense of the human soul in an evolutionary context.

#### **Bio**

Fr. Terry Ehrman, C.S.C., is a Visiting Assistant Professional Specialist in the Department of Theology at the University of Notre Dame. He investigates the relationship between theology and science, particularly the life sciences of ecology and evolution. His interests include understanding who God is as Creator, who we are as creatures, and what our relationship is to God, ourselves, and the natural world. He teaches a course in the Department of Theology entitled *Science, Theology, and Creation* and *Theology and Ecology*. He has a B.S. in biology

from Notre Dame, M.S. in aquatic ecology from Virginia Tech, M.Div. from Notre Dame, and a Ph.D. in systematic theology from The Catholic University of America.

### **“Technology, Culture, and Friendship”**

#### **Jeffrey Bishop (Saint Louis University)**

There are those that have argued that we must technologically enhance human morality, by designing it into the human genome and brain. After all, they claim, technological evolution is outrunning human moral evolution. I will describe the relationship between tekhnê (technology) and culture, and the philosophical anthropology that underwrites this way of imagining human beings and human culture such that these thinkers can imagine the legitimacy of moral bioenhancement. Whereas once it was thought that human culture was carried through technics, technology is increasingly taking the lead, outpacing human beings and human culture. Technology needs a cultural intervention.

#### **Bio**

Jeffrey Bishop is a professor of Philosophy at Saint Louis University. He holds the Tenet Endowed Chair in Health Care Ethics; he is also the director of the Albert Gnaegi Center for Health Care Ethics. Bishop was a practicing physician for 17 years prior to coming to Saint Louis University in 2010, and has published widely in medical, philosophical, theological, humanities, and ethics journals. His research interests focus on the historical, political, and philosophical conditions that underpin contemporary medical and scientific practices and theories. He is also the author of *The Anticipatory Corpse: Medicine, Power, and the Care of the Dying*. He is completing a second book, *Chasing After Virtue: Neuroscience, Economics, and the Biopolitics of Morality*.